

Fostering Tolerance: The Effectiveness of The Religious Education Policy Model in Religion-Based Higher Education in Creating a Culture of Religious Tolerance

Muh Saerozi

*Fakultas Tarbiyah dan Ilmu Keguruan, Universitas Islam Negeri Salatiga
muh.saerozy@gmail.com*

Rifqi Aulia Erlangga

*Fakultas Tarbiyah dan Ilmu Keguruan, Universitas Islam Negeri Salatiga
07rifqi@gmail.com*

Nor Adha bt Abdul Hamid

*International Islamic University College Selangor Malaysia
noradha@kuis.edu.my*

Abstract

This research aims to examine the religious education policies of private universities in Indonesia that have a minority-religion base in a majority-religion environment. The three universities selected as samples were Universitas Pendidikan Muhammadiyah (Unimuda) Sorong, Universitas Santu Paulus (Unika) Ruteng, and Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana (UKSW) Salatiga. According to the qualitative study, UNIMUDA Sorong is the only university that has adopted confessional pluralism. Confessional pluralism was found to be the best model for religious education. Unimuda's confessional religious education model provides religious education courses tailored to each student's religion. Meanwhile, two other colleges, Unika Ruteng and UKSW Salatiga, are implementing a semi-confessional pluralism policy. This semi-confessional pluralism policy is the novelty of this study. This policy establishes religious education as a general subject with general content that covers the six formal religions in Indonesia.

Keywords: *Religious Education Policy; Confessional; Majority and Minority Religions*

Abstrak

Penelitian ini bertujuan untuk melihat kebijakan pendidikan agama di perguruan tinggi swasta di Indonesia yang memiliki basis agama minoritas di lingkungan dengan agama mayoritas. Tiga universitas yang dipilih sebagai sampel adalah Universitas Pendidikan Muhammadiyah (Unimuda) Sorong, Universitas Santu Paulus (Unika) Ruteng, dan Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana (UKSW) Salatiga. Berdasarkan studi kualitatif, Unimuda Sorong adalah satu-satunya universitas yang mengadopsi pluralisme konfesional. Pluralisme konfesional ditemukan sebagai model terbaik untuk pendidikan agama. Model pendidikan agama konfesional Unimuda menyediakan mata kuliah pendidikan agama yang disesuaikan dengan agama masing-masing mahasiswa. Sementara itu, dua perguruan tinggi lainnya, Unika Ruteng dan UKSW Salatiga, menerapkan kebijakan pluralisme semi-konfesional. Kebijakan pluralisme semi-konfesional ini merupakan hal baru dalam penelitian ini. Kebijakan ini menetapkan pendidikan agama sebagai mata kuliah umum dengan muatan umum yang mencakup enam agama formal di Indonesia.

Kata Kunci: *Kebijakan Pendidikan Agama; Konfesional; Agama Mayoritas dan Minoritas.*

INTRODUCTION

Religious education is one of the compulsory subjects in undergraduate and diploma programs in Higher Education.¹ The variations type and shape of the college enable the production of religious education in the differential models. Differences may occur because of the potential of the region and the environment that vary between one college to the others just as mentioned in Article 4 of Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 20 of 2003 concerning the National Education System.² Indonesia has various types of universities. The government establishes State Universities (PTN), and the community can establish private Universities (PTS). PTS is divided into two groups, private religious universities, and general private universities. PTN has a relatively similar religious education policy pattern, but PTS has various religious education policies according to the organization's vision and mission.

Theoretically, there are four policy models of religious education in an educational institution—the policy model of domination, abandonment, pluralism, and conventional pluralism.³ The domination model occurs when students with different religions from the university's mainstream religion are required to follow it. The model of abandonment occurs when students with different religions from the mainstream religion of the university are not given religious education according to their religion, but students whose religion is the same as the mainstream of the university are given religious education according to their religion. The pluralism model occurs when universities do not provide religious education to their students. And lastly, pluralism confessional happens when colleges give religious education to students based on their religion.

PTS organized by an entity that had a foundation in some particular religion must have a vision of religion according to the entity. For instance, the Islamic mission in Islamic universities, the Christian mission in Christian Universities, the Catholic mission in Catholic Universities, the mission of Buddha in Buddhist universities, and the mission of Hindus in Hindu universities. PTS which are organized by religious-based bodies, can be located in various regions. For example, Unimuda Sorong is based on Islam in a predominantly Christian community. UKSW Salatiga is based on Christianity in a predominantly Muslim community. Unika Ruteng is based on

¹ Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, “Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi,” 2012.

² Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, “Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No 20 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional,” 2003, http://stpi-binainsanmulia.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/Lamp_2_UU20-2003-Sisdiknas.doc.

³ M. Saerozi, “Politik Pendidikan Agama Dalam Era Pluralisme (Telaah Historis Atas Kebijaksanaan Pendidikan Agama Konfesional Di Indonesia)” (Yogyakarta, Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, 2003), <http://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/15047/>.

Catholicism in a predominantly Catholic community. The students of PTS are also diverse. For example, the University of Islam has non-Muslim students, the University of Catholic has non-Catholic students, and the University of Christian has non-Christian students.

Noting the wide phenomenon of religion-based universities, the policy of religious education is interesting to study. There are three fundamental reasons. First, religious education has the function of forming students to be faithful, pious, and noble, and to maintain religious harmony. Second, private universities not only have a role as an educational forum for prospective national leaders, a center for the study of virtue and moral strength but also a center for the development of national civilization under the articles of higher education functions of the Law of the Republic of Indonesia No. 12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education.⁴ Third, the elements of faith and purity, the components of noble character and harmony, and aspects of leadership and moral strength are essential parts of the national pillar. This study was not carried out on all religion-based universities but was limited to universities with unique criteria: Unimuda Sorong based on Islam in the predominantly Christian, UKSW Salatiga based on Christian in the predominantly Muslim, and Unika Sorong based on Catholic in predominantly Catholic.

Table 1. Table of Population Distribution by Religion (in%)⁵

Province	Islam	Christian	Catholic	Hindu	Buddha	KongHu Chu	Other
Central	96.74	1.77	0.98	0.05	0.16	0.01	0.29
Java							
West	15.89	65.48	17.67	0.09	0.05	0.00	0.82
Papua							
East Nusa Tenggara	9.05	34.74	54.14	0.11	0.01	0.00	1.94

Table 2. Table of Estimated Distribution of Students by Religion (in%)

College	Islam	Christian	Catholic	Hindu	Buddha	KongHu Chu	Other
SWCU	35.42	60.17	3.34	0.19	0.87	-	0.01
UNIKA Ruteng	5	8	85	2	-	-	-
UNIMUDA	26	54	20	-	-	-	-

⁴ Indonesia, “Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi.”

⁵ Badan Pusat Statistik, “Sensus Penduduk 2010 - Penduduk Menurut Wilayah Dan Agama Yang Dianut | Indonesia,” *Badan Pusat Statistik*, 2010, <https://sp2010.bps.go.id/index.php/site/tabel?tid=321&wid=0>.

Columns “other” in Table 1 and Table 2 above contain the number of students who: (1) have a religion/belief other than those stated in the table above; (2) do not answer questions regarding their religion/belief; (3) other reasons. The selection of the three universities above is based on their uniqueness.

The religious education policy studied will not cover all aspects but will focus on several aspects. First, the religious education policy for students who have the same religion as the mainstream. Second, the religious education policy for students who have a different religion from the mainstream. From the two research focuses it is expected that the policy model of each subject can be identified. Third, formulate an ideal religious education policy model for a religion-based university. Fourth, knowing the effect of cultural competence and organizational values on universities' religious education. Policy models refer to the four models' theory in the institutional policy of religious education, the model of domination, abandonment, pluralism, and confessional pluralism.⁶

METHODS

Model of Religious Education Policy

Three theories became the foundation for formulating a policy model of religious education. The first is Wirt's Theory. Wirt describes the typology of national policies regarding socialization and institutional control of minorities. This theory classifies communities into two, Dominant and Minority. The dominant group is not always the majority quantitatively. The quantitative minority group can dominate the majority as long as they have power.⁷

⁶ Saerozi, “Politik Pendidikan Agama Dalam Era Pluralisme (Telaah Historis Atas Kebijaksanaan Pendidikan Agama Konfesional Di Indonesia.”

⁷ Frederick M. Wirt, “The Stranger within My Gate: Ethnic Minorities and School Policy in Europe,” *Comparative Education Review* 23, no. 1 (1979): 17–40, <https://doi.org/10.1086/446011>.

Table 3. Policy Model for Minorities based on *Wirt's Theory*⁸

Minority	Acceptance of National Policy	Dominant Group Beliefs	Embrace	Isolation
High			Assimilation	Social isolation
Low			Pluralism	Colonialism

First, assimilation describes the high acceptance and appreciation of the minority in the dominant group culture so that incorporating beliefs occurs in the decision-making process. Through this assimilation policy, minority cultures can even disappear with full participation in national life, for example, Saxon culture into Norman culture in England. Second, cultural pluralism, explaining the minority's low acceptance of dominant beliefs, is limited to things they can tolerate. Through this model, significant participation in community decision-making mechanisms is not hindered by the dominant group. This prototype was found in Switzerland. Third, social isolation explains that minority's access to participate in decision making are low. For example, the black people of America between the Civil War and the mid-1950s were fenced off from all the decision-making processes, even if associated with their condition.⁹

The second theory is the theory proposed by Garcia.¹⁰ Garcia's theory explains the typology of national policies on pluralism in America. There are six types of policies called Six Theories of Communal Living, namely Melting Pot I, Melting Pot II, Racial Separations, Cultural Pluralism, Segregation, and Desegregation-Integration.¹¹ The third theory is Moore's theory. Moore pointed to a term called confessional religious education. The term confessional religious education places religious education as education that aims to instill a sense of faith in students' subjects towards a particular religion.¹²

Based on the three theories above, Saerozi formulated four models of religious education policies: domination, abandonment, pluralism, and confessional pluralism policy model.¹³ To understand this policy model, it is necessary first to understand the meaning of the terms dominant group and minority group. The dominant group refers to the group that can influence or control other groups even though it is a quantitative minority. In contrast, a minority group is a group that is vulnerable to being influenced or controlled even though it is a quantitative majority.

⁸ Wirt.

⁹ Wirt.

¹⁰ Robert L. Garcia, *Teaching in Pluralistic Society: Concept, Models, Strategies* (New York: Harper & Row, 1982).

¹¹ Margaret A. Laughlin, "Review of Ricardo L. Garcia . Teaching in a Pluralistic Society Concepts, and Models, Strategies," *Exploration in Sights and Sounds* 3, no. 3 (1983): 14–16.

¹² Saerozi, "Politik Pendidikan Agama Dalam Era Pluralisme (Telaah Historis Atas Kebijakan Pendidikan Agama Konfesional Di Indonesia.)"

¹³ Saerozi.

Four models are described below, (1) the Domination model occurs when students who have a different religion from the mainstream have to follow the mainstream religion policy; (2) the Abandonment model occurs when students with other religions from the mainstream are not given religious education according to their religion, but students whose mainstream religion are given religious education under their religion; (3) The Pluralism Model occurs when universities do not provide religious education to their students; and (4) The Confessional Pluralism Model occurs when universities provide religious education to students according to their own religion.

The development of a university scientific paradigm (curriculum) must be emphasized in its relationship with the local social environment. The needs of the local community must be considered in developing the scientific paradigm.¹⁴ Several roles that the community expects the university to play are (1) to be a source of ideas for improving the quality and meaning of human life, (2) a place that offers a forum of accountability, and (3) a pioneer for national development with its dynamicity.¹⁵ In order to meet the needs of society as described above, universities must be able to develop themselves continuously.¹⁶

The role of higher education is contained in the implementation of the Tri Dharma of University, namely: Dharma of Education, Dharma of Research, and Dharma of Community Service.¹⁷ The organizing agency's religious vision and mission must normatively refer to Government Regulation Number 55 of 2007 concerning Religious and Religious Education.¹⁸ This regulation still applies in Indonesia. The vision and mission must also refer to Law Number 12 of 2012 concerning Higher Education.¹⁹

This research uses descriptive qualitative methods. Data collection is done through interviews. The interviews involved respondents from three universities that were the research subjects, Unimuda Sorong, Unika Ruteng, and UKSW Salatiga. The respondents are lecturers who have experience being policymakers and students whose religion is non-mainstream. Questions will be compiled in a semi-structured interview transcript (SSI).²⁰ Taking respondents from two

¹⁴ Afiful Ikhwan, "Perguruan Tinggi Islam Dan Integrasi Keilmuan: Sebuah Realitas Menghadapi Tantangan Masa Depan," *Jurnal At-Tajdid* 5, no. 2 (2016): 159–87.

¹⁵ Heriyanta Budi Utama, "Peranan Pendidikan Tinggi Di Masyarakat Dalam Sistem Pendidikan Nasional Dan Langkah Yang Harus Dilaksanakan Dalam Mengantisipasi Perubahan Masyarakat Masa Depan," 2010.

¹⁶ Muhaimin, *Paradigma Pendidikan Islam* (Bandung: Remaja Rosda, 2012).

¹⁷ Sri Yuliawati, "Kajian Implementasi Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi Sebagai Fenomena Pendidikan Tinggi Di Indonesia," *Jurnal Ilmiah Widya* 29, no. 318 (2012): 28–33.

¹⁸ Pemerintah Republik Indonesia, "Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia No. 55 Tahun 2007 Tentang Pendidikan Agama Dan Pendidikan Keagamaan," 2007.

¹⁹ Indonesia, "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi."

²⁰ William C. Adams, "Conducting Semi-Structured Interviews," in *Handbook Pf Practical Program Evaluation*, 2018, 492–505.

different sides (the college’s lecturer/dominant side and the non-mainstream students/minority side) was carried out as a source of triangulation step. The second triangulation technique is data triangulation. Data triangulation was carried out by comparing the results of interviews with the regulations and policies of universities, which were the research subjects, and other relevant laws or government regulations. This triangulation step is similar to the actions taken by Belal, Cooper, and Khan.²¹

This research will follow the steps taken by Rabionet in conducting qualitative interviews.²² The steps are as follows: (a) selecting the type of interview; (b) developing ethical guidelines, (c) developing interview protocols; (d) conducting and recording interviews; (e) analyzing and concluding the results of the interview, and (f) reporting the findings. The data analysis technique in this research will be done qualitatively and manually, according to Vaughn and Turner.²³

Chronology of Data Collection

The research was carried out by following the research design that had previously been made. A total of 18 respondents were asked for their opinion on the formulation of the period previously determined. Here are the respondents' details.

Table 4. Respondents

Respondent Code	Respondent Category	Respondents	Techniques
PUM 01-03	Lecturers of UNIMUDA Sorong	3	Telephone
MUM 01-03	Students or Alumni of UNIMUDA Sorong	3	Telephone
PUKA 01-03	Lecturers of Unika Santu Paulus Ruteng	3	Telephone
ADVANCE 01-03	Student or alumni of UNIKA Santu Paulus Ruteng	3	Telephone
PUKR 01-03	Lecturers of UKSW Salatiga	3	Telephone
MUKR 01-03	Students or Alumni of UKSW Salatiga	3	Telephone
Total respondents		18	

²¹ Ataur Rahman Belal, Stuart M. Cooper, and Niaz Ahmed Khan, “Corporate Environmental Responsibility and Accountability: What Chance in Vulnerable Bangladesh?,” *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 33 (2015): 44–58, <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpa.2015.01.005>.

²² Silvia E. Rabionet, “How I Learned to Design and Conduct Semi-Structured Interviews: An Ongoing and Continuous Journey,” *The Qualitative Report* 16, no. 2 (2011): 563–66.

²³ Porcia Vaughn and Cherie Turner, “Decoding via Coding: Analyzing Qualitative Text Data Through Thematic Coding and Survey Methodologies Decoding via Coding: Analyzing Qualitative,” *Journal of Library Administration* 56, no. 1 (2016): 41–51, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01930826.2015.1105035>.

DISCUSSION

Model of Religious Education Policy Currently, PTUS is based on Religion

Based on the research findings, respondents felt different experiences in each of the universities studied. UNIMUDA, with Islam as the mainstream religion, provides Islamic Religious Education to Muslim students and other Religious Education according to each student's religion (PUM 01 PUM 02 PUM 03, 01 MUM, MUM 02 MUM 03).

"... for the first semester, religious education was divided into two classes because there are two major religions here, they are Islam and Christianity. So, Christians have to take Christian classes, taught by qualified lecturers, and so Muslims, also have to take Islamic classes" (PUM 02)

Another result found in Unika Santu Paulus Ruteng, the interviewer indicated that Religious Education was given in general under the name of "Religious Education" only; it was not mentioned as "Catholic/Christian/Islam Religious Education" or other religions. The students would approach according to their respective religions (PUKA 01, PUKA 01, PUKA 01, FACE 02, MUKA 02).

"... However, there are no courses specifically in the name of Islam or Catholicism. The name of the course is "Religious Education", and the material includes the approach of Islam in the world of health, the approach of Catholicism in the world of health, the approach of Catholicism in the context of education, the approach of Islam in the context of education, depending on the faculty" (PUKA 02)

Finally, the research results at UKSW Salatiga showed a slight difference in answers between one respondent and another. PUKR 01 revealed that, currently, there was only Religious Education, in which there was no specific reference to a particular religion. A statement from PUKR 02 supported PUKR 01's opinion. Meanwhile, from PUKR 03, a statement was obtained that revealed that Religious Education at SWCU was Christian Religious Education.

"Religious education is not only Christianity but invites five religions in belief for one semester"(PUKR 02)

"The religion in the sense of Christianity must be taken by students regardless of their religion but in the context of science or knowledge. So, because we are a Christian institution, it is mandatory for anyone, whether Christian or non-Christian, all of them. However, we lecturers always underline that there is a characteristic that is Christianity itself as a Christian institution. Nevertheless, again, this is not teaching about belief but teaching science."(PUKR 03)

Model of Religious Education Policy Ideal for Religion-Based PTUS

The religious atmosphere as a manifestation of Religious Education at UNIMUDA was deemed to be very good. The religious education provided followed their respective beliefs, making students feel comfortable. Moreover, students have never felt discrimination or domination from a particular religion. According to the respondents, the religious education system at UNIMUDA Sorong is already excellent. However, when asked about potential areas for improvement, they provided some suggestions. It contained hopes that were not related to policy but focused on learning methods, teaching innovation, and continuing the Religious Education course in semester one and in the following semesters, such as in semesters two and three.

"... maybe, religious education should not only be applied only in semester one or lower-level but if possible, it should be adjusted in semester two or three." (MUM 01)

Meanwhile, the Religious Education Policy at UNIKA Ruteng, which had the Religious Education model in general and was not separated according to each student's religion, was deemed that the results were quite good even though the hope found was to separate them. The two major religions in UNIKA Ruteng were Catholicism and Islam. The students thought it would be better if Catholic Religious Education and Islamic Religious Education were made separately. Likewise, the lecturers' opinion also agreed that if Religious Education was separated according to their respective religions, they felt that it would be more effective. Besides, related to the issue of radicalism that is rife, one of the lecturers, who was also supported by several students, suggested that radicalism and tolerance material could be added to Religious Education.

"My only hope is about the class to be differentiated; if there is Catholic, it is made Catholic class; if it is Islam, an Islamic class is made."(MUKA 02)

Similar to the findings obtained at UNIKA RUTENG, respondents considered that separating Religious Education according to each student's religion was the ideal model of Religious Education policy. Additionally, respondents at UKSW Salatiga also expressed a desire for additional material on tolerance to ensure inclusivity and avoid any perception of one religion being superior to others.

"..if possible it would be great to study other religions and study about tolerance "(MUKR 03)

Cultural Competence in Influencing Religious Learning in Higher Education

UNIMUDA SORONG, which is geographically located in Papua, is known to have a thick eastern culture. However, UNIMUDA Sorong's establishment with its Islamic identity did not cause religious or ethnic conflict on campus. UNIMUDA was actually received with open arms by the Sorong people. Cultural acculturation impacted directly and indirectly on religious education at

UNIMUDA Sorong. As with "local intimacy", Christian students could say *thayyibah* sentences, such as *Alhamdulillah*, *SubhanAllah*, and so on. Vice versa, Muslim students also lightly adjusted by mentioning phrases, such as Lord Jesus or Lord Allah. What can be underlined from the above explanation is that religious and cultural tolerance at UNIMUDA Sorong is a necessity.

"Because UNIMUDA is in Papua, and we generally know that Papua is famous for its large number of ethnic, cultural, and linguistic ethnic groups, so to increase the tolerance the university should further enhance carrying out cultural events from each student through the cultural collaboration. From that events, students can feel their ethnicity because Papua is dominated by various tribes. For example, I am from the Sorong, some from Jayapura, and various Papua places. Therefore, do not just focus on one culture from one area. Thus, if possible, it can be mixed; for example, from other regions, they can fill in, etc., so that we can recognize that this region also has a different culture. Hopefully it can make some improvements in tolerance"
(MUM 01)

Meanwhile, UNIKA Ruteng, as a university with a majority of religions adhered to was Catholicism and followed by Islam (there were Hindu students, but the percentage was tiny), had excellent religious tolerance. It was evidenced by several cultural and religious celebrations, which were celebrated simultaneously by promoting tolerance. For example, when Catholics celebrated the Eucharist, Muslim students felt comfortable and were not compelled to participate in the celebration or not. The respondent further explained that, for example, they chose to be involved, they only helped in certain sections of the activity, such as specific sections in a committee. Saying congratulations to each other on religious holidays is another example; for example, during Eid al-Adha, non-Muslim students, apart from giving congratulations, also allowed Muslim friends to return home and celebrate with their families. Likewise, for other holidays, such as Catholicism or Hinduism.

UNIKA Ruteng also conveyed more or less the same thing, but from a different point of view. As an example of the illustration, a respondent from the manager stated that lecturers usually permitted students to leave lectures before Friday prayers temporarily for Friday prayer activities. Next is the Manggarai community's philosophy, which is very close to the concept of diversity so that tolerance and acceptance of each other on the UNIKA Ruteng campus were also carried over.

"From what I see, the majority of religions in Unika Ruteng are only Catholic and Islam, while Hinduism is very small. If the exact data, I do not hold it. One example form of tolerance here is if on Friday around twelve o'clock and above we give the moslem students time break to perform Friday prayers." (PUKA 01)

In line with UNIKA Ruteng, at UKSW Salatiga, the issue of tolerance is no longer a problem. Students were even given a project to make a film about tolerance to learn about each student's various cultures. Then, regularly, there was also an Indonesian International Festival Culture event, or abbreviated as IIFC, a kind of cultural expo event, in which various ethnicities and cultures of SWCU Salatiga students were displayed to the public. Therefore, through such activities, one of them is that the religious climate at SWCU was formed.

"Yes, the cultural climate in our place, especially outside Christianity itself, in my opinion is quite good. Especially in the Student Organization, there is an IIF every year; if I am not mistaken, it stands for Indonesian International Festival Culture. It is a kind of cultural expo, in which it describes the diversity in Satya Wacana, not only diversity related to culture but also religion. It is where cross-cultural and inter-religious togetherness occurs. Even in Student Organizations, students also come from multi religions. In the Student Organization itself, there is the climate built through students related to diversity in Satya Wacana." (PUKR03)

Organizational Value in Influencing Religious Learning in Higher Education

The organizational value at UNIMUDA Sorong is Islamic Muhammadiyah, which is in the form of Al Islam and Al Ihsan curricula. Interestingly, the respondents explained that the content was precisely about multicultural learning. Multiculturalism is meant to see Islam not as a subject but rather as a social practice. Researchers assumed it as one of the main reasons that made UNIMUDA entirely accepted by Sorong people. In short, multicultural learning discussion did not lead to worship and faith but more to morals. So then, UNIMUDA also provided material on Christian Religious Education, or other religions besides Islam, with lecturers under its students' beliefs. One respondent also said that UNIMUDA Sorong's Rector gave a strong message to the lecturers to provide the best service to anyone regardless. Therefore, students in Sorong, even though they had different beliefs, for example, Christianity (and there, the number of Christian students was far more than Muslim students), really appreciated the manager and their friends who had other religions and respected all the various ethnic groups on campus.

"We are implementing the latest Al Islam/Al Ihsan Muhammadiyah curriculum about multicultural learning. Thus, there is guidance in Muhammadiyah which do not see Islam as a subject, but rather to social practice." (PUM 01)

Referring to the interview by telephone, not much can be explored about the organizational value apart from the respondent PUKA 03, who more or less said that UNIKA Santu Paulus Ruteng was quite inclusive. Although it was recognized that the institution's identity is Catholic, the campus was very open. In addition to the two major religions, namely Catholicism and Islam, the

respondent also mentioned Protestantism. An explanation then followed that UNIKA Ruteng saw this phenomenon from a broad educational perspective to lead to tolerance and openness.

In line with the previous opinion, a respondent from UKSW Salatiga stated that the values practiced were definitely Christian, but they were still open. It means that it remains open to discussion space, and there have never been any related problems. PUKR 01 then talked about non-Christian employees. On Eid days, they visited each other and brought gifts to one another called "nyedulur" in Javanese terms. As if they supported what was conveyed by PUKR 01, PUKR 02 stated that UKSW's ideology is Alkitabiyah as the source of all education sources, but it remained open and tolerant. For example, about how to dress, UKSW Salatiga allowed Muslim students to wear hijab. On another occasion, PUKR 03 stated that UKSW Salatiga is indeed a Christian institution, so its characteristics are, of course, Christian, he emphasized that Christianity on campus for non-Christian students is in the context of science.

"Basically, because it is a Christian university, the values given and practiced in their daily life are definitely Christian values, but we do have non-Christian employees and a lot of non-Christian students. During Eid, we give gifts or visit their houses. We are more into the culture. Javanese people called it "nyedulur". Honestly, because I am also Javanese, I also celebrate Eid. Thus, until now, it is still embedded in my mind that Eid is the time to forgive each other, no matter what religion they have." (PUKR 01)

Policies or Procedures Currently Applicable in Higher Education to Promote Cultural Competence and Owned Organizational Values

UNIMUDA Sorong, as the only university (apart from UNIKA Santu Paulus Ruteng and UKSW Salatiga), that actually and openly provided Christian Religious Education courses with lecturers who were also Christian, as well as serving other beliefs with the same facilities as religious education with implementing multicultural policies. If looking in more detail, specifically on religious education for Muslim students, as with others, it is sure that students got the right religious education and focused on strengthening aqidah. For non-Muslim students, for example, Christianity, the policies or procedures at UNIMUDA Sorong also had the same attitude, providing equally good service to all students with their respective beliefs. Furthermore, the Rector officially gave the lecturer the mandate to provide the best service to anyone and put forward what was given the term "transfer of kindness".

"So far, for the policy, we use the primary reference is SBMI 4.0, issued by the Diktilitbang Council, we also use Mubammadiyah Central Leadership which contains Al Islam and Al Islam. We teach Al Islam and Al Ihsan in four semesters: AIK 1 faith and humanity, AIK

2 worship and muamalah, AIK 3, if I am not mistaken, kemuhammadiyah, and AIK 4 Islam and science. "(PUM 02)

On the other hand, as a college with cultural and organizational values based on Catholicism, the policy taken by UNIKA Ruteng was an inclusive policy, which was open to all religions. The religious education given did not refer to one particular religion but was given in general.

"We are indeed a Catholic campus, a Catholic university, but however, in fact, this campus is also quite inclusive, open to all religions. " (PUKA 03)

Furthermore, UKSW Salatiga is a college that adopts Christianity, with Alkitabiyah principles, so, of course, the policies taken will not abandon Christian principles. Even so, UKSW, with its tagline "Mini Indonesia and Creative Minority", continues to try not to differentiate between all religions.

"Because this institution contains not only Christians, there are also non-Christian lecturers, especially Muslims, both senior and middle. As an institution with a mini Indonesian icon and tagline, we hope that it will continue to not differentiate each religion. Especially concerning race, it is one of our characteristics: we have a vision of a creative minority. However, we do not expect our students to have the same beliefs. As a Christian Institute, we teach Christianity, but not to persuade students to follow our believe" (PUKR 03)

Religious Education in Higher Education, Peace and Harmony of Intra and Inter-Religious Relations

Religious education is not solely focused on forming students who are faithful, devoted to God Almighty, and have a noble character, but must also maintain peace and harmony of intra-and inter-religious relationships. The phrase "able to maintain peace and harmony in intra-and inter-religious relations" was translated by the researcher as a form of tolerance and the real practice of diversity. As in general, all respondents put this concept forward very much on campus, so indirectly, this research is also intended to show how tolerance and diversity are deeply rooted in various parts of the country.

"... we are very grateful because we can live with tolerance with friends who have different beliefs with us" (MUKA 03)

"... UNIMUDA is one of the campuses with high tolerance in carrying out social relations, having good relations with fellow religions and even other religions ... "(MUM 01)

"Related to culture itself at SWCU, I think it is quite open. Open enough, not then monotonous. What is the name, in the quotation marks for the Christian institution at SWCU, it means that friends are given freedom..." (MUKR 01)

Interpretation of Results

When viewed from Wirt Theory, the researchers assume that in general, in the three universities studied, in fact, the policy model was a little assimilative even though cultural pluralism was dominant.²⁴ Meanwhile, the thin assimilative policy model can be seen from the high acceptance and appreciation of the minority over the dominant group. The researchers called it a thin assimilation policy because the impact did not extend to the loss of minority cultures. Judging from Garcia Theory²⁵ with the six types of policies formulated, also known as Six Theories of Communal Living, it can be assumed that the three universities were more inclined towards cultural and religious pluralism.²⁶

Meanwhile, based on Saerozi,²⁷ of the four categories formulated: domination, neglect, pluralism, and confessional pluralism, the one that best fitted the last category was UNIMUDA Sorong. Meanwhile, UNIKA Ruteng and UKSW Salatiga need a new category between pluralism and confessional pluralism. Thus, the researchers then gave a new category, called "approaching confessional pluralism", or "semi-professional pluralism."

UNIKA Ruteng had Religious Education, but it was not specific to a particular religion. Religious education provided was general. The material contained general knowledge of all formal religions in Indonesia. This policy cannot be classified as a model of domination, neglect, or pluralism policies. However, to say that it is a confessional pluralism policy is also imperfect because it does not explicitly accommodate its students' different religions.

Similar findings were also found at UKSW Salatiga, where the religious education policy cannot be categorized as explicitly as explained above. Even so, there were differences in the application of religious education between UNIKA Ruteng and UKSW Salatiga. UNIKA Ruteng had a religious education entitled "Religious Education" with the content of general knowledge of the six formal religions in Indonesia. Meanwhile, UKSW Salatiga had a religious education entitled "Religious Education," emphasizing that religion is a science, and at the end of lectures, religious figures from six formal religions in Indonesia will be presented.

In a further discussion at UNIMUDA Sorong, researchers found a phenomenon similar to the research conducted by Aryanto, which examined the pattern of diversity in Muslim

²⁴ Wirt, "The Stranger within My Gate: Ethnic Minorities and School Policy in Europe."

²⁵ Garcia, *Teaching in Pluralistic Society: Concept, Models, Strategies*.

²⁶ Laughlin, "Review of Ricardo L . Garcia . Teaching in a Pluralistic Society Concepts, and Models, Strategies."

²⁷ Saerozi, "Politik Pendidikan Agama Dalam Era Pluralisme (Telaah Historis Atas Kebijaksanaan Pendidikan Agama Konfesional Di Indonesia.)"

communities amid non-Muslim environments.²⁸ From his research results, it was revealed that when the Muslim community became a minority, it was proven to place themselves according to their precision to choose the appropriate attitude, such as being exclusive, inclusive, or pluralist in the right situation and time. Likewise, vice versa, non-Muslim communities amid an Indonesian Muslim environment were considered capable of adapting and living up to Islamic values in their character.²⁹

Consistent with this study's results, Aryanto³⁰ and Wekke³¹ also stated that the Muslim community in Papua was formed in 1512. From its long journey to date, apart from the Islamic tradition that has been continuously maintained, at the same time, religious harmony with other devotees is also guarded.³² According to Wekke, religious-based universities in West Papua do not restrict students from certain religions. He firmly stated that all religions have the right to attend the lecture process.³³

From Sorong, Papua, to a broader area, nationally, UNIMUDA Sorong deserves to be one of the essential pillars in maintaining the country's unity and integrity by practising tolerance and values of diversity in real life on campus. As Solikhin conducted, it analyzed the definition of a minority in the context of majority Islam and the diversity of states together with the role of the state in minority issues.³⁴ The results suggested that Indonesia deserves praise for its diversity and tolerance of diversity. People who adhere to different religions remain in harmony, not trapped in horizontal conflicts that are at risk of undermining national unity and state integrity.^{35,36}

Turning to UNIKA Santu Paulus Ruteng and UKSW Salatiga, based on this study's results, both are consistent with Kimanen findings, where religion in Finland is safely and freely studied in

²⁸ Saleh Tri Aryanto, *Minoritas Muslim Di Kalangan Mayoritas Kristen* (Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, 2013).

²⁹ Muhammad Syahrul Kahar and Daeng Pabalik, "Profil Pendidikan Karakter Mahasiswa Non Muslim Dalam Implementasi Al-Islam Dan Kemuhammadiyah," *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 1 (2018): 79–88.

³⁰ Aryanto, *Minoritas Muslim Di Kalangan Mayoritas Kristen*.

³¹ Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Minoritas Muslim Di Indonesia: Peta Jalan Penelitian," in *15th ADRI International Conference*, vol. 13, 2017, 1576–80.

³² Ismail Suardi Wekke, Asep Hermawanto, and Muhammad Ashrori, "Keberagamaan Mahasiswa Di Perguruan Tinggi Wilayah Minoritas Muslim," *ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam* 17, no. 2 (2017): 135, <https://doi.org/10.18860/ua.v17i2.3976>.

³³ Ismail Suardi Wekke, "Agama, Persaudaraan Dan Ikatan Emosional: Harmoni Sosial Minoritas Muslim Papua Barat" (Malang, Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim, 2015), <http://etheses.uin-malang.ac.id/2503/>.

³⁴ Ahmad Solikhin, "Islam, Negara, Dan Perlindungan Hak-Hak Islam Minoritas," *Journal of Governance* 1, no. 1 (2016), <https://doi.org/10.31506/jog.v1i1.1312>.

³⁵ F. Fauziah and F. Fathiah, "Islam in Minority Muslim Countries: A Case Study on Japan and Korea," *World Journal of Islamic History and Civilization* 1, no. 2 (2011): 130–41.

³⁶ İbrahim Aşlamacı and Recep Kaymakcan, "A Model for Islamic Education from Turkey: The Imam-Hatip Schools," *British Journal of Religious Education* 39, no. 3 (2017): 279–92, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2015.1128390>.

classrooms without significant obstacles.³⁷ They also share similarities with research conducted by Roux in South Africa. It was found that in South Africa since the launch of the National Policy on Religion and Education in 2003, the government has urged all teachers and students in public schools to have knowledge of different cultures, religions, beliefs, and value systems.³⁸ If these regulations refer to confessional theory, South Africa adheres to the pluralism school of thought. However, regarding pluralism, which is studying all kinds of religions, they did not study it.

Comparing with the findings of the discussion above and research by Nogueira-Godsey³⁹ and Dreyer⁴⁰, the researchers interpreted that SWCU Salatiga and UNIKA Ruteng were in accordance with the non-confessional description but did not result in the relative neglect of the religious identities of teachers and students.

CONCLUSION

Researchers concluded several vital points from this research on Religious Education. First, for religious education for students with the same religion as their campus identity, only UNIMUDA Sorong make it, which clearly provided religious education (Islam for UNIMUDA, Catholicism for UNIKA, and Christianity for UKSW). At UNIKA Ruteng, if all students were Catholic in one batch of semester, Religious Education would automatically switch to special material for Catholics. However, if the students' beliefs in one batch were different, then the material was Religious Education in general. It was different from UKSW Salatiga, which provided general religious education; however, experts from all religions were presented in the class at the end of the lecture. Second, for religious education for students with different religious mainstream beliefs in their universities (non-Muslim for UNIMUDA, non-Catholic for UNIKA, and non-Christian for UKSW), only UNIMUDA Sorong make this practice. As for UNIKA Ruteng and SWCU Salatiga, as explained earlier, both did not expressly provide religious education courses for religions other than Catholicism and Christianity.

Third, according to respondents, there were several answers regarding the ideal religious education, but the majority agreed that the best religious education was given separately according to the

³⁷ Anuleena Kimanen, "Measuring Confessionality by the Outcomes? Islamic Religious Education in the Finnish School System," *British Journal of Religious Education* 38, no. 3 (2016): 264–78, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2014.984582>.

³⁸ Cornelia Roux, "Religion in Education: Perceptions and Practices," *Scriptura* 89, no. 0 (2013): 293, <https://doi.org/10.7833/89-0-1017>.

³⁹ Elaine Nogueira-Godsey, "Recent Observations on Religion Education in South Africa1," *British Journal of Religious Education* 38, no. 3 (2016): 229–35, <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2016.1205847>.

⁴⁰ J.S. Dreyer, "The National Policy on Religion and Education in South Africa: Reflections from a Public Practical Theology," *Practical Theology in South Africa= Praktiese Teologie in Suid-Afrika* 22, no. 2 (2007): 40–60.

students' beliefs. That way, students did not feel the existence of discrimination or dominance from certain religions. Adding material about tolerance (even though the results have already been outstanding) and about radicalism can be done.

Fourth, concerning culture at UNIMUDA, cultural acculturation impacted directly and indirectly on religious education at UNIMUDA Sorong. There was "local intimacy", where Christian students could pronounce *thayyibah* sentences, such as *Alhamdulillah*, *SubhanAllah*, and so on. Moreover, Muslim students also lightly adjusted by mentioning phrases, such as Lord Jesus or Lord Allah. There was an emphasis that religious and cultural tolerance at UNIMUDA Sorong was a necessity. This cultural collaboration made the embodiment of the value of diversity visible in various aspects of everyday life on campus.

As for UNIKA Ruteng, as a university with a majority of religions embraced is Catholicism and followed by Islam (there are Protestant and Hindu students, but the percentage is very small), had very good religious tolerance. It was evidenced by several cultural and religious celebrations, which were celebrated simultaneously by promoting tolerance in addition to congratulating and helping each other in celebrations of different religions. Another example is tolerance towards Muslim students on Fridays, where the lecturers were used to give leeway in the lecture process. Besides that, the issue of tolerance at UKSW Salatiga is no longer a problem. For example, regularly, the Indonesian International Festival Culture or IIFC was held there, a kind of cultural expo where various ethnicities and cultures of UKSW Salatiga students were displayed to the public. Therefore, through such activities, one of them is that the religious climate at UKSW was formed.

Fifth, the organizational values at UNIMUDA Sorong that the researchers found were that the managers clung to the guidelines from PP Muhammadiyah in the form of the *Al Islam* and *Al Ihsan* curriculum. Interestingly, respondents explained that the content was precisely about multicultural learning. Multiculturalism is meant to see Islam not as a subject but rather as a social practice. The discussion of multicultural understanding does not lead to worship and faith but more to morals. Therefore, UNIMUDA then also provided material on Christian Religion Education, or other religions besides Islam, with lecturers in accordance with its students' beliefs. One respondent also said that the Rector of UNIMUDA Sorong gave a strong message so that the lecturers provided the best service to anyone regardless.

Meanwhile, UNIKA Santu Paulus Ruteng was quite inclusive. Respondents stated that although it was recognized that the institution's identity is Catholic, the campus was very open. Apart from the two major religions, namely Catholicism and Islam, which was then followed by Protestantism, seeing the phenomena from a broad educational perspective still leads to tolerance and openness.

Furthermore, at UKSW Salatiga, a result was obtained that the values practiced were definitely Christian but still open, meaning that they still opened space for discussion. Hence, the ideology at UKSW was Alkitabiyah as the source of all sources for education, but it remained open and tolerant. Furthermore, on another occasion, a resource person said that UKSW Salatiga was indeed a Christian institution, so its characteristics were, of course, Christian, and he emphasized that Christianity on campus for non-Christian students was in a scientific context, not teaching beliefs. Sixth and the last, policies related to organizational culture and values, the answers obtained from UNIMUDA Sorong are as follows. At UNIMUDA Sorong, all students with any belief received the same facilities and quality. Religious Education at UNIMUDA for Muslim students, like others, ensured that students got the right religious education and focused on strengthening the faith. For non-Muslim students, for example, Christianity, the policies or procedures at UNIMUDA Sorong also had the same attitude, providing equally good service to all students with their respective beliefs. The campus even proactively adapted its curriculum, which resulted in the first semester, Christian Religious Education courses could be carried out. Furthermore, the Rector also officially gave the manager the mandate to provide the best service to anyone and put forward what was given the term "transfer of kindness".

As for UNIKA, as a campus with culture and organizational values based on Catholicism, the policy taken by UNIKA Ruteng was an inclusive policy, which was open to all religions. The religious education provided did not refer to one particular religion but was given in general. Unless all students had the same religion (Catholic) in one batch/one semester, the Religious Education provided was Catholic Religious Education. Similarly, UKSW Salatiga, a campus that adopts Christianity with Alkitabiyah principles, the policies taken will not abandon Christian principles. However, UKSW, with its tagline as Indonesia mini and the creative minority, did not differentiate between students based on their religion.

This research can provide answers to the formulation of the problems posed and find a new category that has not been discussed by previous theories on religious education. This study found that of the three PTUSs studied, only UNIMUDA Sorong had adopted the ideal model of religious education policy, namely the confessional pluralism model. The confessional religious education model implemented by UNIMUDA was to provide religious education courses separately according to each student's religion. Meanwhile, two other PTUSs, namely UNIKA Ruteng and UKSW Salatiga, were known to be implementing a semi-confessional pluralism policy. This semi-confessional pluralism policy is the finding of this study. This policy places Religious Education as

a general subject, followed by all students, in which the material provided is general material that discusses six formal religions in Indonesia.

Although there were differences between the three PTUS as the research subjects, there was also one significant similarity. It was the respect for religious and cultural tolerance, which was very high in these universities. The various religious, ethnic, and racial backgrounds of students owned by these higher institutions did not become an obstacle to progress and develop together. Thin cultural assimilation (called lean because it did not eliminate the majority and minority cultures) was well-formed.

This research is done in the pandemic so that the research can only be carried out by conducting online interviews via telephone and text communication media (WhatsApp and email). The limited space for research has caused some research plans to be passed, such as direct observation to PTUS research subjects, group discussion forums for students who become respondents and interviews with respondents directly. Missing opportunities for researchers to make observations, limited the data obtained from each university. When the current pandemic 19 Covid ended, the research can be repeated with the processes that are consistent with the research guidelines, and they are the implementation of the observation, focus group discussions and interviews, where everything is done directly (offline).

Besides, because this study raises quite a sensitive issue, respondents are not easy to find. Some potential respondents even rejected it directly or indirectly. The suggestion that can be given to university researchers is private commercial, which has a base value of religion. First, through this research, it is found that the ideal model of religious education is a model of confessional pluralism. So, holding a course on Religious Education as a mandate of the law is ideally separated according to each student's religion. This research also found that an ideal material in religious education is material about morals and tolerance. It is hoped that private and public universities can accommodate these findings.

REFERENCES

- Adams, William C. "Conducting Semi-Structured Interviews." In *Handbook Pf Practical Program Evaluation*, 492–505, 2018.
- Aryanto, Saleh Tri. *Minoritas Muslim Di Kalangan Mayoritas Kristen*. Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, 2013.

- Aşlamacı, İbrahim, and Recep Kaymakcan. "A Model for Islamic Education from Turkey: The Imam-Hatip Schools." *British Journal of Religious Education* 39, no. 3 (2017): 279–92. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2015.1128390>.
- Belal, Aatur Rahman, Stuart M. Cooper, and Niaz Ahmed Khan. "Corporate Environmental Responsibility and Accountability: What Chance in Vulnerable Bangladesh?" *Critical Perspectives on Accounting* 33 (2015): 44–58. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cpa.2015.01.005>.
- Dreyer, J.S. "The National Policy on Religion and Education in South Africa: Reflections from a Public Practical Theology." *Practical Theology in South Africa= Praktiese Teologie in Suid-Afrika* 22, no. 2 (2007): 40–60.
- Fauziah, F., and F. Fathiah. "Islam in Minority Muslim Countries: A Case Study on Japan and Korea." *World Journal of Islamic History and Civilization* 1, no. 2 (2011): 130–41.
- Garcia, Robert L. *Teaching in Pluralistic Society: Concept, Models, Strategies*. New York: Harper & Row, 1982.
- Ikhwan, Afiful. "Perguruan Tinggi Islam Dan Integrasi Keilmuan: Sebuah Realitas Menghadapi Tantangan Masa Depan." *Jurnal At-Tajdid* 5, no. 2 (2016): 159–87.
- Indonesia, Pemerintah Republik. "Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia No. 55 Tahun 2007 Tentang Pendidikan Agama Dan Pendidikan Keagamaan," 2007.
- . "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 12 Tahun 2012 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi," 2012.
- . "Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No 20 Tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional," 2003. http://stpi-binainsanmulia.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2013/04/Lamp_2_UU20-2003-Sisdiknas.doc.
- Kahar, Muhammad Syahrul, and Daeng Pabalik. "Profil Pendidikan Karakter Mahasiswa Non Muslim Dalam Implementasi Al-Islam Dan Kemuhammadiyah." *Al-Hayat: Journal of Islamic Education* 2, no. 1 (2018): 79–88.
- Kimanen, Anuleena. "Measuring Confessionality by the Outcomes? Islamic Religious Education in the Finnish School System." *British Journal of Religious Education* 38, no. 3 (2016): 264–78. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2014.984582>.
- Laughlin, Margaret A. "Review of Ricardo L. Garcia . Teaching in a Pluralistic Society Concepts, and Models, Strategies." *Exploration in Sights and Sounds* 3, no. 3 (1983): 14–16.
- Muhaimin. *Paradigma Pendidikan Islam*. Bandung: Remaja Rosda, 2012.

- Nogueira-Godsey, Elaine. "Recent Observations on Religion Education in South Africa1." *British Journal of Religious Education* 38, no. 3 (2016): 229–35. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01416200.2016.1205847>.
- Rabionet, Silvia E. "How I Learned to Design and Conduct Semi-Structured Interviews: An Ongoing and Continuous Journey." *The Qualitative Report* 16, no. 2 (2011): 563–66.
- Roux, Cornelia. "Religion in Education: Perceptions and Practices." *Scriptura* 89, no. 0 (2013): 293. <https://doi.org/10.7833/89-0-1017>.
- Saerozi, M. "Politik Pendidikan Agama Dalam Era Pluralisme (Telaah Historis Atas Kebijaksanaan Pendidikan Agama Konfesional Di Indonesia." Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, 2003. <http://digilib.uin-suka.ac.id/15047/>.
- Solikhin, Ahmad. "Islam, Negara, Dan Perlindungan Hak-Hak Islam Minoritas." *Journal of Governance* 1, no. 1 (2016). <https://doi.org/10.31506/jog.v1i1.1312>.
- Statistik, Badan Pusat. "Sensus Penduduk 2010 - Penduduk Menurut Wilayah Dan Agama Yang Dianut | Indonesia." *Badan Pusat Statistik*, 2010. <https://sp2010.bps.go.id/index.php/site/tabel?tid=321&wid=0>.
- Utama, Heriyanta Budi. "Peranan Pendidikan Tinggi Di Masyarakat Dalam Sistem Pendidikan Nasional Dan Langkah Yang Harus Dilaksanakan Dalam Mengantisipasi Perubahan Masyarakat Masa Depan," 2010.
- Vaughn, Porcia, and Cherie Turner. "Decoding via Coding : Analyzing Qualitative Text Data Through Thematic Coding and Survey Methodologies Decoding via Coding: Analyzing Qualitative." *Journal of Library Administration* 56, no. 1 (2016): 41–51. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01930826.2015.1105035>.
- Wekke, Ismail Suardi. "Agama, Persaudaraan Dan Ikatan Emosional: Harmoni Sosial Minoritas Muslim Papua Barat." Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim, 2015. <http://etheses.uin-malang.ac.id/2503/>.
- . "Minoritas Muslim Di Indonesia: Peta Jalan Penelitian." In *15th ADRI International Conference*, 13:1576–80, 2017.
- Wekke, Ismail Suardi, Asep Hermawanto, and Muhammad Ashrori. "Keberagaman Mahasiswa Di Perguruan Tinggi Wilayah Minoritas Muslim." *ULUL ALBAB Jurnal Studi Islam* 17, no. 2 (2017): 135. <https://doi.org/10.18860/ua.v17i2.3976>.
- Wirt, Frederick M. "The Stranger within My Gate: Ethnic Minorities and School Policy in Europe." *Comparative Education Review* 23, no. 1 (1979): 17–40. <https://doi.org/10.1086/446011>.

Yuliawati, Sri. “Kajian Implementasi Tri Dharma Perguruan Tinggi Sebagai Fenomena Pendidikan Tinggi Di Indonesia.” *Jurnal Ilmiah Widya* 29, no. 318 (2012): 28–33.