Comparison of hybrid learning in Islamic education at middle school

Aida Hayani[1], Bagus Prasetya Aji[2], Akhmad Zulfikar Khabibulloh[3],
UPSI Malaysia[1], Malaysia, Universitas Almaata Yogyakarta[1,2], Indonesia,
UIN Sunan Kalijaga[3], Indonesia,
aidahayani@upsi.edu.my[1], 191100503@almaata.ac.id[2],
ahmeddzulfiqar12@gmail.com[3].

Abstract

After more than one year of education in Indonesia implementing learning in a waydaring it turns out that this has a negative impact on students. The purpose of this study is to compare online learning with offline learning (hybrid) at middle schools. The method used in this research is methodmix methods namely a method that combines quantitative research and qualitative research. The approach in this study uses the approach method sequential explanatory designs, where in the first stage the research is carried out using quantitative methods, namely searching for data which will then be analyzed using SWOT analysis and in the second stage it is carried out with qualitative methods using interview methods. The results of this study show the value of IFAS and EFAS in each lesson, namely 3.22, 2.68, 2.65 and 3.27. The results of qualitative research in this study show that in online learning students of class VIII SMP Mataram Kasihan show adaptations that are not appropriate or not optimal, this results in a decrease in the value of learning outcomes obtained by students. Whereas in offline learning the students of Mataram Kasihan Middle School showed a positive attitude in the form of enthusiasm, joy, joy, enthusiasm and like new motivation that had returned when offline learning had been carried out.

INTRODUCTION

Covid-19 pandemic virus is forcing educational institutions to change the way they deliver learning, with offline learning no longer possible in many cases. This phenomenon gives rise to various complex problems, ranging from limited access to technology and the internet, to difficulties in maintaining student interaction and motivation. In this context, a unique research object is the distance learning strategies implemented by rural schools in certain regions. Despite various challenges, such as limited infrastructure and resources, these schools have succeeded in creating creative solutions to facilitate distance learning for their students.

The Covid 19 pandemic has changed the order of life in the world. This impact makes education weak in Indonesia in the learning process. Due to the Covid 19 virus which is spreading rapidly throughout the world, including Indonesia (Ilyasir & Farhana, 2021). Of course this is not easy for educational institutions to adapt to the conditions of the Covid 19 pandemic. Teachers and students should be able to interact freely in the learning process due to the Covid 19 pandemic, the learning process is carried out in a limited manner (Ekantini, 2020).

After more than one year of education in Indonesia implementing online learning it turns out that this has had a negative impact on students (Ardiana et al., 2021). The students lose their enthusiasm for learning, lose their discipline, and even lose the responsibility for school assignments that are usually done by parents so that in the end it is the parents themselves who have difficulty measuring their children's learning outcomes. Therefore, the central government decided to carry out face-to-face learning (PTM) (Ketaren et al., 2021).

According to Iva & Adi learning is defined as a teaching and learning process carried out without face-to-face processes where students and teachers are in different places, so an interactive telecommunication system is needed to become a connecting medium between teachers and students as well as other complementary media needs (Ambarita et al., 2020). In other words, online learning is a solution to overcome problems in the teaching and learning process during the Covid 19 pandemic and can provide security for students and educators (Yulianti & Utomo, 2022).

Astini explained that online learning is a learning system that is carried out or implemented through a computer media network (internet) which is accessed by students anytime and anywhere. In its implementation, online learning is supported through online

learning devices such as smartphones, computers or laptops with adequate connections using several applications such as Google Meet, Zoom, live chat, or through the WhatsApp group application (Wahyudi & Yulianti, 2021).

Offline learning is an abbreviation of the word offline which is currently being used, which means outside the network. According to Ambarita et al, offline learning is a learning activity or interaction carried out by educators with students without utilizing internet activities (Ambarita et al., 2020). The advantages of offline learning are that one of them is the availability of students or students to attend face-to-face learning which affects psychology, nature, and emotion when learning so that learning becomes easier and more efficient (Nengrum et al., 2021).

From the explanation regarding online and offline learning above, both have their own advantages and disadvantages in the learning process (Guraya, 2020). According to Nengrum et al., one of the advantages of online learning is that previously provided material can be accessed again by students, while the drawback lies in the ineffective delivery of material to students due to the absence of direct supervision by the teacher (Tirtarahardja & Sulo, 2015). From several explanations regarding the advantages and disadvantages of online and offline learning, it is common to say that a new learning system was created as a complement to the previous system. In other words, currently education is not only borne by school institutions and teachers as educators, but there must be a role for parents as a companion for children in the learning process. In online learning, there is no physical need like a classroom, because learning can be held anywhere. While the offline system must have a short distance to improve the quality of learning.

From this phenomenon is interesting for further research because it offers valuable insight into the adaptability of the education system in facing the crisis as well as the implications of distance learning strategies for balancing access and quality of education. Therefore, this research is relevant and useful in developing understanding and solutions to today's educational challenges. The researcher was interested in conducting a study entitled "Comparison of Online and Offline Student Learning Outcomes in PAI Learning at SMP Mataram Kasihan". In this study, the researchers focused on comparing student learning outcomes when done online and offline as well as parents' satisfaction with their children's learning outcomes.

METHOD

The method used in this study is a qualitatif. Qualitative research is a research approach that aims to understand phenomena or problems in depth, throught collecting and analyzing data that descriptive, unstructured and not measured quantitatively. This method emphasizes narrative data collection, observation, interviews and text analysis.(Sarwono, 2011).

The main goal of qualitative research is to gain a deep understanding of the context, processes, and meaning behind the phenomenon under study. This approach not only aims to explain what happened, but also why and how it happened. By exploring the social, cultural, and historical context surrounding a phenomenon, qualitative research helps in understanding the complexities and nuances involved. In qualitative research, researchers seek to capture the perspectives, beliefs, values, and experiences of individuals or groups involved in the phenomenon (Sarwono, 2011). Through approaches in this research such as participant observation, in-depth interviews, or text analysis, and too this research also use questionnaire. It can explore the meanings underlying actions and interactions, as well as investigate how contextual factors influence the phenomena under study.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Framework of Hybrid

In the Pedagogical Design Factors That Enhance Learning in Hybrid Courses: A Contribution to Design-Based Instructional Theory said that the integration of transactional distance theory with the community of inquiry framework to analyze how technologically enhanced activities can create more effective hybrid learning environments. They found that low structure combined with high levels of dialogue and learner autonomy promoted student satisfaction(Shea et al.,

In hybrid learning, the combination of various pedagogical approaches can enhance both student experiences and academic outcomes. For instance, a hybrid model integrating team-based and case-based learning showed significant improvements in students' academic performance and engagement, due to effective curriculum contextualization and fostering positive social interdependence among students.

Valuates a hybrid teaching method for a graduate planning theory course. The research compares the hybrid format to traditional class formats, assessing student

performance, satisfaction, and instructor insights. The findings indicate that students in the hybrid class performed comparably to those in traditional settings, appreciated the online components, though they rated overall class experience slightly lower. The instructor noted the potential of hybrid teaching for enhancing student learning but also mentioned it required more preparation time (Willson, 2008).

How several foundational learning theories can be integrated into a hybrid e-learning model for an internationally accredited training course. The research highlights the application of community adaptive learning, collaborative learning, scaffolding, and scenario learning within a hybrid e-learning system, showing that these methods were effective in meeting the training objectives. The study also suggested potential improvements by considering individual learner attributes (Tsai, 2011). Further, incorporating technology in hybrid courses allows for a mix of face-to-face and online learning activities, enhancing active learning and reducing traditional classroom time, which can lead to more personalized and flexible learning experiences. Overall, hybrid learning models that skillfully combine various pedagogical strategies and technology can significantly enhance the learning experience by promoting greater student interaction, autonomy, and satisfaction.

SWOT Analysis

In this study, researchers used a SWOT analysis matrix. This matrix is the choice for the majority of organizational or management officials because this matrix contains quantitative elements that are easy to understand, simple and can reduce subjective elements among the public. In emphasizing the quantitative elements, this matrix is prepared by determining the weight and rating of each of the factors from both IFAS and EFAS. The IFAS and EFAS data are then processed using the SWOT matrix by giving ratings and weights (Abna et al., 2022).

The results of the identification of the types of variables from the results of the questionnaire with the respondents, obtained the strengths and weaknesses of online learning. From the results of the data obtained, then the data is processed to obtain the weight and rating. To measure the extent to which the strengths and weaknesses of online learning affect the learning outcomes of students at SMP Mataram Kasihan. This calculation uses the Internal Factor Analysis Summary (IFAS) matrix model, which is as follows (Fatimah, 2016).

Table 1. Internal Factor Analysis Summary (IFAS) Matrix for

Online Learning SMP Mataram Kasihan Yogyakarta

No	Variable	Weight	Ratings	X Rating weight
	Strength			
1	Efficient learning place	0.11	3	0.34
2	All students have smartphones	0.13	4	0.54
	Weaknesses			
3	Students still have difficulty understanding the material presented because it is not carried out face to face	0.13	3	0.40
4	Teachers give a lot of assignments without seeing the condition of students	0.09	4	0.36
5	There is a lot of miscommunication between teachers and students	0.13	3	0.40
6	Learning is disturbed a lot due to geographical conditions (signal)	0.13	3	0.40
7	Less varied learning	0.11	3	0.34
8	Lack of supervision of student assignment reports	0.13	3	0.40
	Total Score			3,22

Table.2 External Factor Analysis Summary (EFAS) Matrix for

Online Learning SMP Mataram Kasihan Yogyakarta

No	Variable	Weight	Ratings	X Rating weight
	Opportunities			
1	Add new insights about technology and learning	0.18	3	0.56
2	Increase student learning independence	0.12	2	0.25
3	Learning can be supervised by parents	0.18	2	0.37
	Threats			
4	Decreased learning motivation	0.18	3	0.56
5	Many students feel bored with learning	0.12	3	0.37
6	The material is not conveyed properly	0.18	3	0.56
	Total Score			2.68

Table 3. Internal Factor Analysis Summary (IFAS) Matrix for

Offline Learning SMP Mataram Kasihan Yogyakarta

No	Variable	Weight	Ratings	X Rating weight
	Strength			
1	Student learning is more focused	0.13	3	0.39
2	Learning can be monitored directly by the teacher	0.08	3	0.26
3	Reduction of internet quota fees for parents for students	0.13	3	0.39
4	Standardization of curriculum delivery can be done clearly	0.08	3	0.26
5	Monitoring/supervision of assignments can be carried out directly by the teacher	0.08	3	0.26
	Weaknesses			
6	KBM is not effective because there is a reduction in learning hours	0.13	2	0.26
7	Limited use of technology	0.13	3	0.39
8	Lack of student independence	0.08	2	0.17
9	Distance in taking long learning	0.13	2	0.26
	Total Score			2.65

Table 4. Internal Factor Analysis Summary (IFAS) Matrix for

Offline Learning SMP Mataram Kasihan Yogyakarta

No	Variable	Weight	Ratings	X Rating weight
	Opportunities			
1	Fun learning experience	0.27	3	0.81
2	The teacher's approach to students is more effective	0.27	3	0.81
	Threats			
3	Lack of technology knowledge for students	0.18	3	0.54
4	Student boredom with too many assignments given by the teacher	0.27	4	
	Total Score			3,27

The SWOT Matrix will provide a clear picture of how the external opportunities and threats faced by an organization or institution can be adjusted to the strengths and weaknesses it has. From the respective SWOT matrices above, namely online learning and also offline learning at Mataram Kasihan Middle School, several strategies can be taken, namely as follows (Sudiartini et al., 2020):s

First, SO Strategy (Strength and Opportunity). This strategy is made based on the mindset of educational institutions, namely Mataram Kasihan Middle School and the relevant stakeholder actors (teachers, students, and parents/guardians), namely Mataram Kasihan Middle School utilizing all the internal strengths they have to be able to seize and take advantage of good and appropriate opportunities. educational purposes. *Second*, ST Strategy (Strengths and Threats). The strategy is to use the strengths of each learning system owned by Mataram Kasihan Middle School to be able to overcome external threats in accordance with various deliberations. *Third*, WO Strategy (Weaknesses and Opportunities). This strategy is processed based on taking advantage of existing opportunities by minimizing weaknesses in each learning system that is implemented for better continuity of learning during the Covid-19 pandemic and also post-pandemic at SMP Mataram Kasihan. *Fourth*, WT Strategy (Weaknesses and Threats). This strategy is made based on defensive activities and seeks to reduce or minimize weaknesses in order to avoid existing threats.

From the results of the SWOT matrix, it shows that there are several indicators that will be able to advance the learning system at SMP Mataram Kasihan, namely as follows:

First, teachers must have skills and as a facilitator in the process of learning activities. In the current era, there is a concept called soft skill education which means education that has relevance to the abilities possessed by a person. Through soft skill education, education is taught to be able to have the ability to communicate and socialize with the surrounding environment, in this case students and also parents/guardians.

Second, teachers always innovate in the learning process. The teacher is an important instrument for ensuring whether or not a learning objective is achieved, based on indicators that have been made according to the needs of students. The success of students is a form of success from educators when carrying out learning innovations. When carrying out learning everything must be well planned, measurable learning innovations so as to be able to provide the right services for students.

Third, keep maintaining and using the right learning applications for children. With the development of the times, information technology and the world of entertainment are also developing rapidly. Which in turn causes children to prefer watching movies, playing games, making them prefer to open the internet which the terms will then become their teacher rather than having to hear explanations from the teacher directly.

Because of this, today's teachers are asked to be able to create learning that is both interesting and entertaining so that they are not inferior to increasingly sophisticated technological developments. In addition, in this era, learning activities are asked to reduce the application of the lecture method and be diverted by using a lot of media. Especially in current learning activities that place more emphasis on processes and active learning, the role of learning media is becoming increasingly important.

Fourth, maintain intensive communication between parents, children, and educators. Support from parents for each student activity is a very important thing in the process of implementing children's learning. Because as we know that parents are the first school for every child. In addition, in order to achieve character education, educational institutions or schools must continue to maximize the role of parents. Schools must be able to continue to use the resources they have to be able to collaborate with teachers and parents of students. Therefore schools must take the initiative to continue to maintain the wisdom of parents to continue to be involved in the education of students both at school and at home.

Comparative Analysis

Hybrid learning theory is a learning approach that combines elements of online and face-to-face learning to create a holistic and integrated learning experience. In the context of distance learning due to the pandemic, this theory becomes very relevant because it offers views on how to align online learning with students' needs and characteristics and create an effective learning environment.

There are several theories and concepts that can be the basis for understanding hybrid learning. One of them is constructivism theory which emphasizes the importance of active learning, where students build their own knowledge through interaction with learning material. In the context of effective online learning, indicators such as content interactivity, online discussions, and collaborative projects can be parameters for assessing the extent to which the learning supports constructivism.

Apart from that, social activity theory in learning is also relevant in the context of online learning. Indicators such as collaboration between students through online learning platforms, project-based learning that encourages cooperation, and social support from teachers and fellow students are aspects that can be observed in analyzing the effectiveness of online learning. Meanwhile, cognitive theory about how humans learn (cognitive learning

theory) can provide insight into how to organize online learning materials that suit students' cognitive abilities. Indicators such as the use of a variety of learning media, clear learning structures, and the use of learning strategies that arouse interest and attention can be a focus in analyzing online learning.

Based on previous research, the supporting factors for the success of online learning consist of, the first is technology, students and teachers must have access to exchange synchronization and asynchronous exchanges. The second is the character of the teacher, namely the teacher must play a central role in online learning, the most important thing is not explaining technology, but the importance of implementing learning in technology from the teacher which will later have an effect on learning, students who are present in class with teachers who have positive attitudes towards delivery learning and understanding a technology will tend to produce more positive learning. The last factor is student characteristics (Fitriyani et al., 2020).

However, the implementation of online learning at the Mataram Kasihan Middle School is experiencing problems or has inhibiting factors related to these supporting factors. Even though every student and teacher has technology that is sufficient to support it, not all students can apply learning through this technology properly. For example, many grade VIII students don't focus when online learning takes place. This is considered because it will affect the learning effect in the form of student learning outcomes. This obstacle will require the role of parents as facilitators in the form of supervision so that students can carry out learning at home with a focus. In addition, teachers are required to increase creativity in order to make learning more interesting and fun (Hadisi & Muna, 2015).

According to Mr. Sarwoto, the learning outcomes during online learning at the Mataram Kasihan Middle School raised many doubts about their purity. Mr. Sarwoto in his interview when giving assignments on online learning methods, it was suspected that there was interference from parents. In this position, parents are not supervisors of the online learning process, but parents who work on it and students are only limited to copying assignments given by the teacher, this makes it difficult for teachers to measure or see students' actual abilities. In contrast to offline learning, where learning outcomes are purely the result of students' work, not the interference of other people, so the teacher can see the academic abilities, attitudes, and skills of students.

In addition, not all Mataram Kasihan Middle School students have high self-discipline basic skills to carry out online learning, and not only that, not all students also get good supervision from both parents, because their parents are busy working (Nurrita, 2018). This explanation is supported by research by Sari et al., that online learning can be done if students have high self-confidence and above average intelligence. Whereas for students who lack discipline and self-confidence, it is better to use conventional learning methods or offline learning methods. In PAI online learning at the Mataram Kasihan Middle School, it shows that there is a lack of enthusiasm from students. For example, on prayer practice material, material on reading the Qur'an, and other religious practices carried out by students are not optimal. Teachers also cannot make corrections optimally due to connection signal interference and so on. Compared to religious practices during offline learning, teacher and student interactions can be carried out well (Fitriya et al., 2021).

The description above is also supported by the statements of Hadisi and Muna which state that one of the shortcomings of online learning is the lack of direct interaction between students and teachers or between students and other students. This will affect student participation in learning, students tend to be passive in the learning process when learning should be constructive. However, in reality, students only carry out learning with assignments given by the teacher, students only work on questions, memorize and also write. This means that student learning motivation tends to be lower in the implementation of online learning (Syahidin, 2021).

According to Mr. Sarwoto, S.Sos, I as the teacher of Islamic Religious Education and Moral Education Subjects, there is almost no online learning in interaction between fellow students. He explained that in offline learning students usually discuss each other in group learning, have conversations with each other, and interact physically, but in online learning students only focus on communicating with the teacher. In other words, it is feared that students will have difficulty finding social values. such as respecting other people's opinions, listening to other people talk, daring to ask questions, not imposing their will on others, and other social values and norms. This is also supported by research by Nengrum et al., (Nengrum et al., 2021).

Based on research conducted offline learning is indeed more possible and also effective at SMP Mataram Kasihan, because offline learning is considered to be able to

Provide direct and real learning experiences to students. In contrast to offline learning, online learning is still difficult to implement considering that there are many obstacles that are considered difficult to overcome from various indicators that have been presented and processed through a SWOT analysis (Kurnianto, 2022). Therefore offline learning is more suitable to be applied compared to online learning (Rahman, 2012). With the current situation that has recovered, according to a review of researchers through student learning outcomes compared to the following year many get a significant increase.

CONCLUSION

From the results of this study it can be concluded that in online learning students of class VIII SMP Mataram Kasihan show adaptations that are not optimal, this results in a decrease in the value of learning outcomes obtained by students. Whereas in offline learning, SMP Mataram Kasihan students showed a positive attitude in the form of enthusiasm, joy, joy, enthusiasm and like new motivation that had returned when offline learning had been carried out. Offline learning is considered more effective than online learning. Offline learning makes it easier for students to understand the lessons that have been given, direct interaction between students and teachers when learning is carried out. In contrast to online learning, it is very difficult for students to understand the material. In other words, a comparison of student learning outcomes during online learning and offline learning can be concluded that learning outcomes in offline learning are more improved and better.

REFERENCES

Abna, N., Muchlis, N., Yusuf, R. A., Syamsu, A., & Shamad, I. (2022). Tantangan dan Peluang Kegiatan Pertukaran Pelajar Program Merdeka Belajar- Kampus Merdeka (MBKM) Pada Mahasiswa di Universitas Muslim Indonesia. *An Idea Health Journal*, *2*(01), 32–34. https://doi.org/10.53690/ihj.v3i01.70.

Ambarita, J., Jarwati, & Restanti, D. K. (2020). *Pembelajaran Luring*. Indramayu: Penerbit Adab.

Ardiana, S., Rahayu, M. S., & Asmawan, M. C. (2021). Analisis Penerapan Model Pembelajaran Problem Based Learning dalam Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa. *Buletin Literasi dan Budaya*, *3*(2), 147–154. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.23917/blbs.v3i2.16491.

Ekantini, A. (2020). Efektivitas Pembelajaran Daring pada Mata Pelajaran IPA di Masa Pandemi Covid-19: Studi Komparasi Pembelajaran Luring dan Daring pada Mata Pelajaran IPA SMP. *Jurnal Pendidikan Madrasah*, *5*(2), 187–194. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.14421/jpm.2020.52-04.

Fatimah, F. N. D. (2016). *Teknik Analisis SWOT Pedoman Menyusun Strategi yang Efektif & Efisien serta Cara Mengelola Kekuatan & Ancaman*. Yogyakarta: Quadrant.

Fitriya, D., Magdalena, I., & Fadhillahwati, N. F. (2021). Konsep Pembelajaran Daring di Era Pandemi Covid-19. *Cerdika: Jurnal Ilmiah Indonesia*, *1*(3), 182–188. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.59141/cerdika.v1i3.30.

Fitriyani, Y., Fauzi, I., & Sari, M. Z. (2020). Motivasi Belajar Mahasiswa Pada Pembelajaran Daring Selama Pandemik Covid-19. *Jurnal Kependidikan*, *7*(1), 121–132. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.33394/jk.v6i2.2654.

Guraya, S. (2020). Combating the COVID-19 outbreak with a technology-driven e-flipped classroom model of educational transformation. *Journal of Taibah University Medical Sciences*, *15*(4), 253–254. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jtumed.2020.07.006.

Hadisi, L., & Muna, W. (2015). Pengelolaan Teknologi Informasi dalam Menciptakan Model Inovasi Pembelajaran (E-learning). *Jurnal Al-Ta'dib*, *8*(1), 117–140. https://doi.org/http://dx.doi.org/10.31332/atdb.v8i1.396.

Ilyasir, F., & Farhana, M. (2021). Peran Masyarakat dalam Pendampingan Pendidikan Agama Islam Anak di Masa Wabah Covid-19. *Kajian Kependidikan Islam*, *6*(1), 50–62. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.22515/attarbawi.v6i1.3711.

Ketaren, A. M. A., Kanca, I. N., & Lesmana, P. K. Y. (2021). Efektivitas Proses Pembelajaran Luring Peserta Didik yang Tinggal Di Asrama dan Daring Bagi Peserta Didik di Luar Asrama Terhadap Hasil Belajar Pjok. *Jurnal Pendidikan Jasmani, Olahraga dan Kesehatan Undiksha*, *9*(1), 29–40. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.23887/jjp.v9iI.36744.

Kurnianto, B. (2022). Analisis SWOT Kesiapan Pembelajaran Tatap Muka Terbatas pada Era New Normal di Kampus Undaris. *Jurnal Wawasan Pengembangan Pendidikan*, *10*(2), 1–9.

Nengrum, T. A., Solong, N. P., & Iman, M. N. (2021). Kelebihan dan Kekurangan Pembelajaran Luring dan Daring dalam Pencapaian Kompetensi Dasar Kurikulum Bahasa Arab di Madrasah Ibtidaiyah 2 Kabupaten Gorontalo. *Jurnal Pendidikan*, *30*(1), 1–12. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.32585/jp.v30i1.1190.

Nurrita, T. (2018). Pengembangan Media Pembelajaran Untuk Meningkatkan Hasil Belajar Siswa. *Misykat: Jurnal Ilmu-Ilmu Al-Quran, Hadist, Syari'ah Dan Tarbiyah*, *3*(1), 171–187. https://doi.org/10.33511/misykat.v3i1.52.

Rahman, A. (2012). Pendidikan Agama Islam dan Pendidikan Islam - Tinjauan Epistemologi Dan Isi - Materi. *Jurnal Eksis*, *8*(1), 2053–2059.

Sarwono, J. (2011). *Mixed Methods Cara Menggabungkan Riset Kuantitatif dan Riset Kualitatif Secara Benar*. Jakarta: Elex Media Komputindo.

Shea, J., Joaquin, M. E., & Wang, J. Q. (2016). Pedagogical Design Factors That Enhance Learning in Hybrid Courses: A Contribution to Design-Based Instructional Theory. *Journal of Public Affairs Education*, *22*(3), 381–397. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1080/15236803.2016.12002254.

Sudiartini, N. W. A., Kardini, N. L., Mulyani, P. A., & Sariani, N. L. P. (2020). Strategi Bisnis Pedagang Kaki Lima Pada Masa Social Distancing Di Kota Denpasar. *Jurnal Bina Wakya*, *14*(11), 3389–3392. https://doi.org/10.33758/mbi.v14i10.562.

Syahidin. (2021). *Pendidikan Agama Islam Kontemporer*. Jakarta: Yayasan Masyarakat Indonesia Baru (YAMIBA).

Tirtarahardja, U., & Sulo, L. (2015). *Pengantar Pendidikan*. Jakarta: Rineka Cipta.

Tsai, A. (2011). A hybrid e-learning model incorporating some of the principal learning theories. *Sosial Behavior and Personality: An International Journal*, *39*(2), 145–152. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.2224/sbp.2011.39.2.145.

Wahyudi, A., & Yulianti, Y. (2021). Studi Komparasi: Motivasi Belajar Siswa Pada Pembelajaran Daring dan Luring di UPT SDN X Gresik. *Jurnal Basicedu*, *5*(5), 4292–4298. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v5i5.1555.

Willson, R. W. (2008). In-Class–Online Hybrid Methods of Teaching Planning Theory: Assessing Impacts on Discussion and Learning. *Journal of Planning Education and Research*, *28*(2), 237–246. https://doi.org/10.1177/0739456X08324286.

Yulianti, K., & Utomo, U. (2022). Perbandingan Implementasi Pembelajaran Daring dan Luring di Sekolah Dasar. *Jurnal Basicedu*, *6*(2), 2410–2418. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i2.2231.